

Review: Juan Pablo Rubio Sadia, *La transición al rito romano en Aragón y Navarra: Fuentes, escenarios, tradiciones* (Napoli, Editrice Domenicana Italiana, 2018), 320 pp., ISBN: 978-88-94876-27-7

Elsa De Luca¹

CESEM
Faculdade de Ciências Sociais e Humanas
Universidade NOVA de Lisboa
elsadeluca@fesh.unl.pt

JUAN PABLO RUBIO SADIA IS THE LEADING EXPERT on the transition between the Old Hispanic and the Franco-Roman liturgy in medieval Spain. The author has explored this topic in earlier publications, focusing on the change of rite in Toledo, Urgell, Palencia and Castile. In this book the analysis is circumscribed to the area of Aragon, Navarra, and La Rioja (in north east Spain). This area was crossed by the main pilgrim routes and it was also considered the door to Europe on account of its proximity to the French Midi and Catalonia, a region where the Franco-Roman liturgy had already been imposed by the Carolingians in the ninth century. More specifically, this book focuses on seven bishoprics: Roda de Isábena (Ribagorza) which was first moved to Barbastro and then to Lérida; Jaca, with its own prelate until the restoration of Huesca; Pamplona; Calahorra; Zaragoza; and Tarazona.

While the change of rite was officially endorsed at San Juan de la Peña in 1071, the transition between the local Old Hispanic liturgy and the imported Franco-Roman one was nevertheless a much longer process, starting in the ninth century and continuing until the thirteenth century. Very little was known about the process of adopting the new liturgy, or about the provenance of the first

This work is funded by national funds through the FCT—Fundação para a Ciência e Tecnologia, I.P., under the Norma Transitória—DL 57/2016/CP1453/CT0085. This research is also part of the SIMSSA Project, which is funded by a Partnership Grant from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada (SSHRC 895-2013-1012).

¹ Scopus Author ID 56950314800; ORCID ID 0000-0001-8020-2697; Ciência ID 051E-2F38-CA4C.

imported Franco-Roman manuscripts, which were used as models for the local production of new books. This is not an easy topic to grasp on account of the scarcity of liturgical books (or fragments) coeval with the change of rite and, often, the lack of a clear indication of provenance in the surviving sources. Rubio Sadia has bypassed this documentary lacuna by systematically pairing historical documentation with the surviving liturgical sources in order to delineate the bigger picture of the change of rite in Aragon and Navarre. Broadly speaking, the author identifies three stages in the adoption and diffusion of the new rite. The first phase started in the ninth and tenth centuries and saw the development of the early monasteries of San Pedro de Siresa and San Vicente de Roda. The second phase started with the official adoption of the Franco-Roman rite in San Juan de la Peña in 1071. The third and final stage started around 1120 with the restoration of the dioceses of Tarazona and Zaragoza.

The book is structured in six chapters, ordered chronologically and geographically. The subtitle of the book 'Fuentes, escenarios, tradiciones' refers to the methodology applied throughout the whole book. In each chapter the author outlines the selected area's historical context, explains how political or other historical factors facilitated or hindered the adoption of the new rite, and considers the role played by local liturgical institutions such as monasteries and cathedrals during the transition. Finally, in order to pinpoint any liturgical or musical peculiarity in the area under consideration, each chapter discusses the contents of the liturgical sources representative of the selected area in comparison with other relevant manuscripts. The list of liturgical sources analysed for this research (pp. 27-32) is astonishing—it even includes some sources never previously catalogued (Barbastro). Indeed, the author lists 103 sources grouped according to the following categories: sources of Aragon, Navarre, and La Rioja; monastic and canonical sources of the most representative liturgical orders; French sources; sources from Narbonne and Catalonia; and other peninsular sources. The aim of this broad selection of sources is clear: to compare the few sources representative of the areas investigated with other manuscripts that are representative of specific liturgical traditions in order to find similarities or idiosyncrasies that could shed light on the models of copying the new liturgy. To this purpose Rubio Sadia examines the Divine Office because this liturgical repertory was much less stable than the mass repertory and might therefore reveal more local or regional peculiarities.

The book opens with a prologue by Carmen Julia Gutierrez (pp. 13-6), who is not only the leader of the research project to which this book project belongs but also a scholar with extensive knowledge of the liturgy and chant in medieval and early modern Spain. In the first chapter (pp. 33-48) the author engages with the early counties of Aragon and Ribagorza (now Huesca) in the ninth and tenth centuries. Both counties maintained a close connection with the Carolingian empire.

Unfortunately, no early liturgical sources from the monastery of San Pedro de Siresa survive. However, this monastery, along with that of San Vicente de Roda were at the forefront of the romanization of the area in the ninth and tenth centuries. Regarding the liturgy at San Vicente de Roda, it shows mixed elements and could be referred to as ‘Catalan-Narbonnese’ (the liturgy of San Vicente was later be exported to Pamplona and other centres).

Chapter 2 (pp. 49-65) focuses again on Ribagorza, more specifically on the analysis of the sources which reflect its *consuetudo*. The sources are manuscripts RC_0029 (*olim* Roda 11), RC_0026 (*olim* Roda 12), both in the Archivo Capitular of Lérida. For the sake of completeness, the analysis also engages with an antiphoner *de Tempore* of Barbastro. Barbastro was an enclave between Aragon and Castile and was therefore a point of convergence between liturgical traditions. The analysis of Roda 11 demonstrates its close similarity with the Breviary of Lérida, now in the Bibliothèque nationale de France (lat. 1309^{A2}) and also with the tradition of Pamplona. The latter connection was previously unknown, and it demonstrates that there were liturgical exchanges between these two churches. The analysis of the Antiphoner of Barbastro shows an almost total correspondence with the liturgical tradition of Huesca, despite some occasional differences which point toward the Catalan-Narbonnese liturgical tradition.

Chapter 3 (pp. 67-97) focuses on some important events of the second half of the eleventh century, such as the adoption of the Rule of Saint Benedict in the monasteries, the rule of Saint Augustine in the cathedral chapters, and the official adoption of the Franco-Roman liturgy. This adoption was officially celebrated during Lent at San Juan de la Peña on March 22, 1071. This monastery would later become a royal pantheon, and both the king and a papal representative were present during the celebration. The author discusses in great detail the role played by this monastery, along with other monastic institutions, during the liturgical transition in Aragon and also describes why King Sancho Ramírez came to take the side of the Pope and his reforms. The liturgical manuscripts that have been securely attributed to the Monastery of San Juan de la Peña are now in the Monastery of San Lorenzo, in El Escorial, and these sources have been closely examined by Rubio Sadia in order to understand the origin of the Franco-Roman liturgy in San Juan de la Peña. The author excludes a close connection with the liturgy of Cluny in San Juan and he demonstrates a close similarity with the liturgical tradition of Santa Cruz de Bordeos and even demonstrates the presence of some Catalan-Narbonnese liturgical vestiges in the liturgy of the Monastery of San Juan de la Peña.

Chapter 4 (pp. 99-117) zooms in on a very specific context: the bishoprics of Jaca and Huesca, which were under the same prelate. Following a geohistorical summary, where the author discusses the Council of Jaca of 1063, he then analyses some local sources of the Divine Office in order to

establish their origins. Specifically, he scrutinizes the breviaries MSS 2, 7, and 8 of the Archivo Capitular of Huesca and some fragments now in Huesca and Jaca. This analysis allows the author to clarify the close connection between manuscript 2 (mid twelfth century) and the liturgy of Auch. Breviaries 7 and 8 (thirteenth century) suggest instead an adaptation of the liturgical tradition of Bearne (Lescar, Oloron) and Bigorra (Tarbes). This fact is particularly significant as it outlines some of the paths of the *receptio* of the Franco-Roman liturgy in Aragon. However, Rubio Sadia also shows that some of the chants are peculiar to the church of Huesca, and are not normally found in Southern French sources. These pieces include the responsory *O summum et inenarrabile* (thoroughly discussed on pp. 111-7) which is found only in the breviaries of Huesca, Calahorra and Osma. Finally, the author advances a new hypothesis concerning the cathedral of Huesca as a centre of diffusion and composition of the new musical liturgical repertory.

Chapter 5 (pp. 119-43) focuses on Pamplona and Calahorra. After setting up the historical and geopolitical scenario, the opposition to the new rite is discussed on three levels: royal (King Sancho Garcés IV) and ecclesiastical (a. Munio de Calahorra and b. the rural churches). He then scrutinises the manuscripts representative of the rite in the cathedrals of Pamplona and Calahorra and engages with the problem of the chronology of the official adoption of the Franco-Roman rite in this area. Very interestingly, Rubio Sadia has managed to prove that the liturgy in Pamplona shows close connections with Roda de Isábena while Calahorra acquired elements from the liturgical traditions of Huesca and Bearne. Calahorra also acted as bridge between the liturgical tradition of Aragon and that which spread in Castile.

Chapter 6 (pp. 145-67) examines the beginning of a new era in the process of the romanization of the area and the diffusion of the Franco-Roman rite in the Ebro valley. In the first half of the twelfth century the two bishoprics of Zaragoza and Tarazona were restored and Tudela (conquered in 1119) passed under the aegis of the diocese of Tarazona. Rubio Sadia studies the breviaries and antiphoners that are more representative of the two newly restored dioceses and includes an analysis of sources from ecclesiastical institutions of lower rank, such as the collegiate churches of Tudela, Calatayud, Daroca and the parish of Munébrega. The author concludes that Tarazona and Zaragoza received the rite from Jaca and Huesca, but Zaragoza also received some liturgical elements from Roda. A short final chapter (pp. 169-72) presents the overall conclusions.

Two useful appendices form a substantial part of the book. Appendix 1 (pp. 173-225) contains the lists of the nocturnal responsories and their verses for the *Proprium de Tempore* in the three manuscripts of roman *cursus* representative of the bishoprics of Roda de Isábena (Lérida, AC, ms. RC_0026, *olim* Roda 12, ff. 10v-154r), Huesca (Huesca, AC, ms. 7, ff. 2r-193v; ms. 8, ff. 1v-152v), and Zaragoza (El Escorial, RB, ms. g.IV.29, ff. 2r-155v). Appendix 2 (pp. 226-54) contains useful

tables where the author compares a selection of offices from all the sources analysed. These tables are extremely useful since they allow one to distinguish at a glance the similarities and differences between the series of responsories. While the author analysed the whole *Temporale* in the source manuscripts, Appendix 2 presents comparative tables of a selection of offices, representing the most complete and significant offices within the whole *Temporale*. The offices presented here are the four Sundays of Advent, Sunday I and IV of Lent, Maundy Thursday, Holy Friday, Easter and its Octave, and three series after Pentecost (*Deus omnium*, *In principio* and *Si bona suscepimus*). Appendix 2 is followed by the bibliography (pp. 255-89) which is structured in three parts (sources, catalogues and inventories, and essays). The book ends with indices of names (pp. 291-8), liturgical manuscripts (pp. 299-308) and printed breviaries (pp. 308-10).

This book is mainly aimed at scholars but students and anyone else interested in liturgy may also enjoy reading it, as Rubio Sadia's writing is clear despite the complex topic and the analysis of an enormous quantity of data (bibliography and manuscript contents). The main challenge in this kind of detailed analysis is that major gaps exist in all collections of early manuscripts. Rubio Sadia was not discouraged by the lack of manuscript evidence and, when early sources were not available, he used some very late sources as the basis for the reconstruction of the change of rite; for example the printed breviary of Tudela dated 1554 (analysed on p. 152 *et seq.*). Another complicating factor—mentioned by the author in the Introduction (pp. 21-6)—is the lack of an interdisciplinary approach in the existing scholarly literature on Aragon and Navarre in the aftermath of the change of rite. Throughout the book Rubio Sadia strives to find answers to a range of questions: what models of copying were used for the early Franco-Roman liturgy, what level of similarity (or disagreement) was there between the surviving liturgical manuscripts from Aragon and Navarre, what role was played by local *scriptoria*, how was the new rite learned, and even how did the local Church end up establishing new local customs and traditions. Readers unfamiliar with the many manuscripts discussed in this book may find it useful to read further information on the elements and criteria that supported the attribution of the selected manuscripts to specific *scriptoria* or dioceses (such as the manuscripts produced in the *scriptorium* of Roda de Isábena, as discussed in chapter 2).

The change of rite in medieval Iberia is a complex topic because of the poor quantity of surviving liturgical manuscripts and because the whole process was heavily affected by the always changing frontiers of the Christian kingdoms and dioceses, and the consequent movement of peoples and institutions. Nevertheless, Rubio Sadia has meticulously reconstructed the transition between the two rites and through his analysis he has demonstrated that the transition to the new liturgy advanced slowly and was subject to all sorts of influences (historical, political and religious).

This new book by Rubio Sadia is essential reading for those interested not only in Iberian liturgy, music and history but also, more widely, in cultural studies. Rubio Sadia has provided a painstaking account full of detailed information on the cultural transformation that was triggered by the abandonment of the Old Hispanic liturgy and its replacement with the Franco-Roman liturgy from Southern France which will also serve as an essential tool for further research.

Elsa De Luca is a music palaeographer carrying out research on Old Hispanic notation, music, and scribes. In addition, she is Coordinator of the *Portuguese Early Music Database*; co-director of the book series *Musicalia Antiquitatis & Medii Aevi* published by Brepols; and she is on the Board of the *Music Encoding Initiative* <<https://music-encoding.org>> for the 2019-21 term.